

THE RULE OF LAW AS A FUNDAMENTAL PRINCIPLE OF THE FUNCTIONING OF THE LEGAL SYSTEM OF DEMOCRATIC COUNTRIES

^aSTELLA KELBIA, ^bNATALIIA ZAKHARCHYN, ^cANDRII SAMILO, ^dYULIIA KOVEINO, ^eIULIIA PUNDOR, ^fVALERII SHYSHKO

^aBukovinian University, 2-A, Darvyna Str., Chernivtsi, Ukraine

^bUkrainian National Forestry University, 103, Gen. Chuprynsky Str., 79057, Lviv, Ukraine

^cLviv State University of Life Safety, 35, Kleparivska Str., 79007, Lviv, Ukraine

^dMariupol State University, 129-A, Budivelnykiv Str., 87548, Mariupol, Ukraine

^eLutsk National Technical University, 75, Lvivska Str., 43018, Lutsk, Ukraine

^fLviv State University of Internal Affairs, 26, Horodotska Str., 79007, Lviv, Ukraine

email: ^astella.kelbya@gmail.com, ^bzakharchin@ukr.net,

^csamilo_79@ukr.net, ^dy.koveyno@mdu.in.ua,

^eyuliapyndor@gmail.com, ^fangelfire1@ukr.net

Abstract: The need to uphold the rule of law in modern democracies is a sign of their cultural and legal development. The set of international legal agreements and documents that define the interaction of state and society defines human rights as a basic value, and the rule of law, in turn, ensures the effective implementation of these rights to the new application of norms and principles of the rule of law. Therefore, the practical implementation of the tasks of ensuring the functioning of a democratic society is inseparable from the principles of the rule of law in the legal system of a democratic state.

Keywords: Democratization of society, Human rights, Legal norms, Principles of law, Rule of law.

1 Introduction

The rule of law is a universal standard of the modern legal system of most countries. Its key importance as a fundamental principle of the functioning of a democratic society is defined in many documents of international organizations and legal associations. In particular, the UN General Assembly Resolution "Rule of Law at the National and International Levels" defines human rights, the rule of law, and democracy as "universal and indivisible fundamental principles of the United Nations" [38]. The doctrine defined by the Venice Commission defines the rule of law as the fundamental basis of European legal orders, without the existence of which it is impossible to respect human rights and the formation of democratic legal relations in society [39].

The historical stages of the formation and development of the rule of law have come a long way in evolution: from antiquity to our time. This led to the fact that at each stage of development of society to understand the essence of the rule of law had its own specific features. In antiquity, the law itself was defined as justice. At the same time, the rule of law was given to the people. With the subsequent development of social relations, the rule of law began to belong to the monarchs who held power in their hands. In recent times, a positive attitude of society to the rule of law has begun to develop rapidly, and basic human rights in democracies have become a priority over the interests of the state in all social processes. However, it should be noted that in modern conditions, the principle of the rule of law has received due legal recognition around the world only since the middle of the last century. At present, however, the requirements for its principles and their observance are enshrined in many defining international legal instruments, which democratic countries are obliged to adhere to.

Thus, it can be argued that the study of the principles of the rule of law is a key area of research in modern jurisprudence in developed democracies. It should be noted about the deepening understanding of the essence and principles of the rule of law at present, which leads to the definition of such elements as rational and emotional in the content of the rule of law and other philosophical and socio-humanitarian aspects of its

understanding. Accordingly, the above-defined variety of approaches to understanding the essence of the rule of law and determines the need for in-depth study of applied and methodological aspects of the rule of law.

2 Literature Review

Many theoretical and practical studies are devoted to the study of the rule of law, its principles, and fundamental elements. In modern conditions, the peculiarities of scientific discussions on the principles of the rule of law cover mainly the question of whether the content of the phenomenon of the rule of law is universal, which applies to all cultures and states, or the rule of law is unique to European culture. It functions successfully and on the basis of which the main principles of functioning of the most developed democratic countries of the world are now built.

Therefore, evaluating the contribution of various researchers in the study of the rule of law as a specific legal and cultural phenomenon, it is necessary to note the work of such scholars and practitioners of legal science as O. Agres [1], O. Apostolyuk [2], N. Bakhmat [3-6], I. Bakhov [7-8], O. Binert [8], A. Boiar [10], Y. Chaliuk [11], M. Dziamulych [12-15; 28-30], S. Holovaty [17], A. Hurzhii [18], M. Koziubra [20], M. Krieger [21], S. Kvitka [22], S. Maksymov [23-24] M. Sellers, and T. Tomashevskiy [25], R. Sodoma [31-33], O. Stashchuk [34-36], J. Tefft [37], V. Visyn [40], I. Yakoviyk [41], Ya. Yanyshyn [42], I. Zhurakovska [43] and others. At the same time, the dynamic changes taking place in the world and related to the globalization and spread of the rule of law and the need to ensure fundamental human rights pose new challenges to the application of the rule of law throughout the world and its principles along with democratization globally.

Thus, there is a need for in-depth study of the essence and principles of the rule of law in terms of its universality, as a specific phenomenon, without which the process of democratic development of society and universal human rights in the world is impossible.

3 Materials and Methods

The methodology of studying the principle of the rule of law is a system of specific approaches, methods, and means of knowing the rule of law, as well as specific patterns of its legislative support and the relationship and interdependence with other principles of law, the rule of law and human rights. The peculiarities of the methodology of the study of the rule of law are based on the use of a special set of general, scientific and special research methods, which generally include the following specific groups:

- Worldview method, which consists in a dialectical understanding of the rule of law and its principles, as well as in the definition of special concepts related to the rule of law, methods of ensuring it, human rights, etc.;
- General scientific methods, which include such elements as system-structural method of the research of the objective need for the existence of the rule of law and the characteristics of its features and general features; the comparative method used to study specific legal phenomena, as well as - the principles of the rule of law and the specifics of its application in democratic societies; a method of deduction that is integral to the study of the relationships and dependencies between legal terms that define the rule of law, legality, and constitutional norms;
- Special methods used to study the principles and essence of the rule of law in the context of globalization and include elements such as the formal legal method that allows to study the essence of the rule of law and its reflection in laws and regulations around the world, including analysis of the specifics and practice of its application in the legal

systems of different countries of the world, as well as is the basis for determining methods and approaches to solving problems with ensuring the rule of law in the democratization of society; the method of interpretation of the law, which contributes to the understanding of the essence of legal norms that determine the rule of law in the legislative systems of the world; as well as a method of studying legal practice, which allows to practically assess the content and specifics of legislative documents that determine the principles of the rule of law and the peculiarities of their application in the legal practice of democratic societies.

However, it should be noted that the application of the methodology of the study of the rule of law is possible only if a comprehensive approach, according to which the principle of the rule of law is considered special and unique, but universal for a democratic society legal, legal and natural phenomena. a special essence of the rule of law, as an integral part of a democratic state governed by the rule of law in the modern world.

4 Results and Discussion

Practical approaches to understanding the essence of the phenomenon of the rule of law, assume that it is based on certain principles and in fact, is a specific regulatory idea, which is based on the social characteristics of human-society interaction with government. At the same time, state power under such conditions must be limited to a set of legal norms and principles that determine the specifics of their application in addressing key legal issues in terms of the democratization of society. Thus, it can be argued that the rule of law under such conditions functions as a special mechanism of social regulation, which ensures the proper interaction of the principles of organization and functioning of a modern democratic society. In addition, the rule of law has its practical reflection in the practical legal processes that arise in society. Accordingly, these principles and features of interaction ensure for society the real observance of the rule of law in the system of public administration, which is a characteristic of democratic societies.

As noted in this aspect, S. Maksymov, the experience of successes and failures in understanding and implementing the rule of law leads to the conclusion of the possibility of double expansion of this idea. First, it must extend to the state as a particular institution and society as a whole (as a society of the rule of law). Secondly, it must be deployed in a system of worldviews - as a special worldview, genetically related to the legal worldview of the modern era (with its ideas of reasonable legislation and human rights), but overcomes its excessive focus on the state and positive law [24].

However, considering the essence of the rule of law as a specific mechanism that contributes to the implementation of the general concept of justice and thus determines the legal basis for defining universal human rights, which are the basic value of democratic societies, it is necessary to refer to basic definitions that reveal the internal meaning of states. In this aspect, it is necessary to pay attention to the work of the European Commission for Democracy through Law (Venice Commission), which identifies a set of necessary elements of the rule of law, which include:

- 1) Legality, including transparency, accountability, and democratic law-making;
- 2) Legal certainty, which provides for the ease and accessibility of clarifying the content of the right and the opportunity provided by legal means to exercise this right in regulatory situations;
- 3) Prohibition of state arbitrariness, including restriction of discretionary powers of state bodies, the validity of their decisions, publicity of information on state power;
- 4) Effective access to justice in independent and impartial courts, judicial control over the legality and constitutionality of acts of state power, the functioning of the independent bar, and the execution of court decisions;

- 5) Observance of human rights, first of all, guarantee of the right to an effective remedy, to a fair trial, to a case by a competent judge, the right to be heard, the presumption of innocence, the prohibition of retroactive effect of law, except those that abolish or mitigate legal liability;
- 6) Non-discrimination and equality before the law, which provides for the absence of laws that contain discriminatory provisions against certain persons or groups or enshrine legal privileges, prohibition of discriminatory interpretation or application of the law [39].

Thus, the basis of the rule of law, as is well known, is based and universally recognized human rights, which act as specific universal legal and cultural principles, which are based on special legal norms determined on the basis of the rule of law. Accordingly, it is on the basis of these norms that cultural and legal mutual understanding of citizens in democratic societies becomes possible, which provides them with an appropriate level of cooperation and interaction in any critical and problematic situations that may arise as they are based on the rule of law. It is on this basis that opportunities arise to address potential challenges that may arise from the contradictions between universal approaches to defining human rights and the regional cultural specificities of each country. Thus, the rule of law allows not only the definition of human rights but also provides the opportunity for their implementation in developed democracies.

In this aspect, it is important to note the approach of J. Habermas, who notes that human rights in conjunction with the people's sovereignty are not a manifestation of Western standards of legitimacy. These standards owe their emergence not so much to the particular cultural background of Western civilization as to an attempt to respond to the specific demands of a social situation called the modern situation. These demands have become global, and they face other cultures in the same way that they once faced Europe when human rights and a democratic constitutional state were "invented." Thus, it can be argued that the principle of the rule of law, given the modern European experience, should be understood as a legal principle formed under the influence of international and European integration processes due to globalization, designed to protect certain rights, fundamental freedoms and legitimate interests of man and citizen. society in relations with public authorities, as well as - the equality of all subjects of law before the law, the rule of law in the system of legislation of the country.

The main purpose of the principle of the rule of law is to ensure freedom and human rights, and, above all, in its relations with public authorities and public authorities. The idea of rule of law from the very beginning was directed against the tyranny and arbitrariness of monarchical regimes and authoritarianism, which often used formal law to achieve illegal goals. Its purpose was to "bind" state power by law, establishing a reliable legal barrier to its unjustified interference in people's lives, creating the necessary legal mechanisms for the implementation and protection of human rights and freedoms [20]. Thus, we come to the conclusion that human rights as a special social institution of society are extremely important for every person, as they provide appropriate conditions for self-realization in a legal society that operates on the principles of the rule of law. At the same time, the principles of the rule of law also ensure the socio-cultural rights of citizens, which is possible only in democratic legal societies, which determine the general legal equality of all members of society. Thus, universal approaches to ensuring respect for the principle of justice, as a basic element of the rule of law, are important to ensure the effective functioning of a legal democratic society as a whole.

Thus, it can be argued that the key goal of the rule of law is not only activities aimed at forming a mechanism that promotes the establishment of a special legal order based on legislation and limited by applicable regulations, but also the actual establishment of such a system of interaction between state and executive authorities. a democratic society that would ensure the rule of law based on democratic principles in general and respect

for human rights in particular. It is implied that the legal norms that determine the legislative system of the state should not function by themselves, because under such conditions they may not reflect the rule of law. Conversely, only those legislative systems that are decisively based on the rule of law actually ensure its observance and contribute to the democratization of society through the recognition of the priority of human rights in legislative and legal acts. Thus, we can conclude that the most effective in the legal sense are those systems that determine the priority of the rule of law, rather than the priority of the rule of law, on which the observance of human rights is based.

In addition, it is also necessary to pay attention to the approach of P. Rabinovich, who also considers the rule of law based on the study of the essential interdependence of the rule of law with human rights. In particular, he believes that human rights are a priority in society, they are manifested in the following features of state and public life: enshrined in the constitutional and other laws of the state fundamental human rights (laws that contradict human rights and freedoms are not legal laws); the domination in public and state life of such laws that express the will of the majority of the entire population of the country, while reflecting universal values and ideals, especially human rights and freedoms; settlement of relations between a person and the state on the basis of the principle: "a person is allowed to do everything that is not expressly prohibited by law". Thus, the rule of law is expressed in inviolable human rights [25].

In general, this approach to understanding the rule of law does not really equate it with the rule of law. And this approach is important precisely because undemocratic societies, in order to ensure the dominance of ruling dictatorships, use the second approach, which in practice may include legislation that restricts the rights, freedoms, and equality of citizens. Accordingly, justice, which underlies the rule of law, is its defining basic basis and ensures the functioning of a specific mechanism for regulating social relations in democratic societies, which is an element of universal values. Therefore, justice in this aspect is seen as a property of law and the legal system, which is manifested in ensuring equal human rights and freedoms in relation to its legal responsibility in accordance with the rules and principles of the rule of law. R. Inglehart's research is important for the transformation of society to democratic principles of its functioning on the basis of human rights and the rule of law. However, in such a situation, mass support for democracy is usually based not on the inner conviction of the subjects, but on utilitarian motivation - for example, on the hope that this regime will provide the population with the same economic well-being as in traditionally democratic countries. According to him, true support for democracy arises when people highly value and consider the civil and political rights it entails to be an end in itself. Such motivation is provided by the values of self-expression because without civil and political freedoms unimpeded self-expression is impossible [19].

Accordingly, the primary principles and preconditions of law are human dignity and freedom (autonomy). Legal certainty, which is ensured by formal equality and a stable procedure, is of paramount importance for their provision. Thus, the law is an obstacle to the tyranny of power, because the state, given its responsibility for public safety and good governance, naturally exaggerates the scale of state interests, or its own perception of the public good and usually does so by oppressing private, individual interests, especially those aimed at criticizing the government and organizing an effective opposition [30].

Thus, it can be argued that in practice one of the most important components of the rule of law and the rule of law is the principle of legal security and protection of public confidence in the reliability of their legal status. The reason for this is that any citizen of a democratic society must always be convinced that his rights and the real legal position in society will remain stable and there is no reason for their potential deterioration in the future. It should be noted that ensuring this state of affairs in democratic societies is a well-known legal principle, which states that the law cannot have a retroactive effect. The

importance of this principle, which is one of the basic elements of the rule of law, is to provide a guarantee to citizens that lawless actions against them will not be possible. The consequence of the application of this principle in the rule of law is the prevention of any manifestations of discrimination against human rights by the state executive through the reverse application of new laws and regulations. It is on this basis that effective cooperation between an effective democratic society and the state in the developed countries of the world, which base their activities on the rule of law, functions.

5 Conclusion

Thus, we can conclude that in modern conditions there is an objective need for normative consolidation of the principle of the rule of law in the legal and legislative field. At the same time, such consolidation is an integral condition for ensuring the effective development of a democratic and independent state in the context of globalization. In addition, the process of enshrining the principles of the rule of law in the legal and legislative norms of the state is extremely important, which serves as an incentive for the democratization of society, as well as ensuring its functioning on the basis of legal justice, social and cultural equality. That is, building a democratic state governed by the rule of law in modern conditions is impossible without providing its citizens with full protection on the basis of observance of the principles and freedoms defined by human rights. And since human rights are determined on the basis of guaranteeing the principles of the rule of law, it should be the basis for the proper and effective functioning of public authorities in democratic countries.

In addition, in defining the essence of the principle of the rule of law, it should be noted that its observance is ensured along with the observance of human rights in democratic societies. This provides for practical implementation in the form of a specific legal mechanism that guarantees citizens compliance with the rule of law at all levels of the state legal system and all state executive bodies. In this case, the application of practical European experience in Ukraine on the actual implementation of the principles of the rule of law is a necessary condition for the transformation of current Ukrainian legislation in order to fully ensure the realization of human rights for citizens.

Finally, the functional features of the rule of law should provide for the daily practical observance of its principles, taking into account the need to ensure socio-cultural and legal equality of citizens. That is, the rule of law is realized at all stages of the functioning of human society and only under such conditions is the state, which guarantees its observance, is able to ensure respect for universal human rights, and can be considered democratic in modern conditions.

Literature:

1. Agres, O., Sadura, O., Shmatkovska, T., & Zelenko, S. (2020). Development and evaluation of efficiency of leasing activities in agricultural sector of Ukraine. *Scientific Papers: Series "Management, Economic Engineering in Agriculture and rural development"*, 20(3), 53-60.
2. Apostolyuk, O., Shmatkovska, T., Chykal, I., & Husak, A. (2020). Assessment of the rural population economic activity in the system of united territorial communities development: a case study of Volyn Region, Ukraine. *Scientific Papers: Series "Management, Economic Engineering in Agriculture and rural development"*, 20(3), 99-108.
3. Bakhmat, N., Krasiuk, L., Kovtun, N., Hudovsek, O., & Hnatiuk, M. (2021). Development and testing new content and forms of organization of pedagogical internship of future primary teachers. *Laplage Em Revista*, 7(Extra-B), 77-87.
4. Bakhmat, N., Kravets, N., Kulikovska, I., Leniv, Z., & Ishchuk, V. (2021). Training of pedagogical staff for conducting activities in the conditions of inclusive education. *Laplage Em Revista*, 7(Extra-C), 559-571.
5. Bakhmat, N., Ridei, N., Tytova, N., Liubarets, V., & Katsero, O. (2021). Methodology of safety and quality of life on

the basis of noospheric education system formation. *Strategies for Policy in Science and Education*. Vol. 29(1), 82-98.

6. Bakhmat, N., Torop, K., Dzhevaha, H., Kuchumova, N., & Shvay, R. (2021). Stem education in general secondary educational institutions. *Laplace Em Revista*, 7(Extra-C), 294-302.

7. Bakhov, I.S., Odarchuk, N.A. & Mironchuk, T.A. (2019). Ukrainian Youth and Scholars in International Academic Mobility: Resources and Opportunities to Self-Realize. *Tarih kultur ve sanat arastirmalari dergisi-Journal of history culture and art research*, 8(3), 138-149.

8. Bakhov, I., Syniavska, A., Sheliukh, O., Ishchuk, N., Terekhova, L., & Bashtannyk, O. (2021). Recent trends in translators training in Ukraine and Europe. *AD ALTA: Journal of interdisciplinary research*, 11(1), Special Issue XVIII, 69-75.

9. Binert, O., Sodoma, R., Sadovska, I., Begun, S., Shmatkovska, T., & Balash, L. (2021). Mechanisms for improving economic relations in the milk subcomplex of the agricultural sector: a case study of Ukraine. *Scientific Papers Series "Management, Economic Engineering in Agriculture and Rural Development"*, 21(2), 101-110.

10. Boiar, A.O., Shmatkovska, T.O. & Stashchuk, O.V. (2018). Towards the theory of supranational finance. *Cogent Business & Management*, 5(1).

11. Chaliuk, Y., Dovhanyk, N., Kurbala, N., Komarova, K., & Kovalchuk, N. (2021). The digital economy in a global environment. *AD ALTA: Journal of Interdisciplinary Research*, 11, Special issue XVII, 143-148.

12. Dziamulych, M., Moskovchuk, A., Vavdiuk, N., Kovalchuk, N., Kulynych, M., & Naumenko, N. (2021). Analysis and economic and mathematical modeling in the process of forecasting the financial capacity of milk processing enterprises of the agro-industrial sector: a case study of Volyn region, Ukraine. *Scientific Papers Series "Management, Economic Engineering in Agriculture and Rural Development"*, 21(1), 259-272.

13. Dziamulych, M., Sadovska, I., Shmatkovska, T., Nahirska, K., Nuzhna, O., & Gavryliuk, O. (2020). The study of the relationship between rural population spending on peasant households with the main socioeconomic indicators: a case study of Volyn region, Ukraine. *Scientific Papers Series "Management, Economic Engineering in Agriculture and Rural Development"*, 20(2), 217-222.

14. Dziamulych, M., Shmatkovska, T., Gordiichuk, A., Kupyra, M., & Korobchuk, T. (2020). Estimating peasant farms income and the standard of living of a rural population based on multi-factorial econometric modeling: a case study of Ukraine. *Scientific Papers Series "Management, Economic Engineering in Agriculture and Rural Development"*, 20(1), 199-206.

15. Dziamulych, M., Yakubiv, V., Shubala, I., Filiuk, D., & Korobchuk, L. (2020). Analysis and evaluation of the rural labour market and employment of the rural population: a case study of Volyn region, Ukraine. *Scientific Papers Series "Management, Economic Engineering in Agriculture and Rural Development"*, 20(4), 165-174.

16. Habermas, J. (2010). The concept of human dignity and the realistic utopia of human rights. *Diánoia*, 55(64), 3-25.

17. Holovaty, S. (2011). Rule of law: as interpreted by the Venice Commission. *Law of Ukraine*, 10, 154-167.

18. Hurzhii, A.M., Bakhmat, N.V., Zaychuk, V.O., Kartashova, L.A., Rozman, I.I., & Sorochan, T.M. (2021). Organizational grounds for development of digital infrastructure of education and pedagogical science in Ukraine (Late 80s of the XX century-beginning of the XXI century). *Information Technologies and Learning Tools*, 83(3), 26-48.

19. Inglehart, R., & Welzel, C. (2005). *Modernization, cultural change, and democracy: The human development sequence*. Cambridge University Press.

20. Koziubra, M. (2012). Rule of law and Ukraine. *Law of Ukraine*, 1-2, 30-63.

21. Krieger, M. (2014). Why the rule of law is too important to leave to lawyers. *Philosophy of law and general theory of law*, 1-2, 323-349.

22. Kvitka, S.A., Yehorova, V.S., Chepulchenko, T.O., Taranenko, M.M., Bakhov, I.S., & Feshchenko, E.L. (2020). Development of Ukrainian and Global Online Education. *TEM*

journal-technology education management informatics, 9(4), 1640-1646.

23. Maksymov, S.I. (2016). Rule of law: worldview and methodological principles. *Bulletin of the Yaroslav the Wise National Academy of Law of Ukraine. Series: Philosophy*, 4, 27-35.

24. Maksymov, S. (2009). The constitutional principle of the rule of law: general and special. *Bulletin of Acad. law sciences of Ukraine*, 3(58), 127-134.

25. Rabinovich, P.M. (1997). *Human and civil rights in the Constitution of Ukraine (before the interpretation of the original constitutional provisions)*. Kharkiv: Pravo, 154.

26. Sellers, M. & Tomaszewski, T. (2010). *The Rule of Law in Comparative Perspective*. Springer: Dordrecht, Heidelberg, London, New York, 253.

27. Shmatkovska, T., Dziamulych, M., Gordiichuk, A., Mostovenko, N., Chyzyh, N., & Korobchuk, T. (2020). Trends in human capital formation and evaluation of the interconnection of socio-demographic processes in rural area: a case study of Volyn region, Ukraine. *Scientific Papers Series "Management, Economic Engineering in Agriculture and Rural Development"*, 20(2), 437-444.

28. Shmatkovska, T., Dziamulych, M., Yakubiv, V., Myshko, O., Stryzheus, L., & Yakubiv, R. (2020). Economic efficiency of land use by agricultural producers in the system of their non-current assets analysis: a case study of the agricultural sector of Ukraine. *Scientific Papers Series "Management, Economic Engineering in Agriculture and Rural Development"*, 20(3), 543-554.

29. Shmatkovska, T., Nikolaeva, A., Zabedyuk, M., Sheiko, Yu., & Grudzevych, Yu. (2020). Increasing the efficiency of the labour resources usage of agrosector enterprises in the system of sustainable development of the rural territories: a case study of Ukraine. *Scientific Papers Series "Management, Economic Engineering in Agriculture and Rural Development"*, 20(4), 467-476.

30. Shylyngov, V.S. (2009). The rule of law is a fundamental principle of the legal system of a democratic society. *Journal of Kyiv University of Law*, 2, 26-29.

31. Sodoma, R., Brukh, O., Shmatkovska, T., Vavdiuk, N., Bilochenko, A., Kupyra, M., & Berezhyntyska, G. (2021). Financing of the agro-industrial complex in the context of the implementation of international experience. *Financial and credit activity: problems of theory and practice*, 38(3), 341-350.

32. Sodoma, R., Cherevko, H., Krupiak, I., Andrusiak, H., Brodska, I., & Shmatkovska, T. (2021). Regulation of the lending market and prospects of financial sector stabilization in Ukraine. *Financial and credit activity-problems of theory and practice*, 36(1), 4-13.

33. Sodoma, R., Shmatkovska, T., Dziamulych, M., Vavdiuk, N., Kutsai, N., & Polishchuk, V. (2021). Economic efficiency of the land resource management by agricultural producers in the system of their non-current assets analysis: a case study of the agricultural sector. *Scientific Papers Series "Management, Economic Engineering in Agriculture and Rural Development"*, 21(2), 577-588.

34. Stashchuk, O., Boiar A., Shmatkovska, T., Dziamulych M., Skoruk O., Tesliuk S. & Zintso Yu. (2021). Analysis of fiscal efficiency of taxation in the system of filling budget funds in Ukraine. *AD ALTA: Journal of interdisciplinary research*, 11(1), Special Issue XVII, 47-51.

35. Stashchuk, O., Shmatkovska, T., Dziamulych, M., Kovalska, L., Talakh, T., & Havryliuk, O. (2021). Integrated assessment, analysis and management of financial security and stability of joint-stock companies operating in the agricultural sector: a case study of Ukraine. *Scientific Papers Series "Management, Economic Engineering in Agriculture and Rural Development"*, 21(2), 589-602.

36. Stashchuk, O., Shmatkovska, T., Dziamulych, M., Kupyra, M., Vahnovska, N., & Kosinskyi, P. (2021). Model for efficiency evaluation of financial security management of joint stock companies operating in the agricultural sector: a case study of Ukraine. *Scientific Papers Series "Management, Economic Engineering in Agriculture and Rural Development"*, 21(1), 715-728.

37. Tefft, J. (2021). Establishing the rule of law in Ukraine: the development of modern society. *Ukrainian Pravda*. Available at: <http://www.pravda.com.ua/columns/2012/04/19/6963027/> (Accessed on 10 Aug. 2021).
38. United Nations General Assembly. (2006). *The rule of law at the national and international levels*. A/Res/61/39. Available at: http://www.un.org/en/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=A/RES/61/39 (Accessed on 10 Aug. 2021).
39. Venice Commission. (2011). *Report on the Rule of Law*. Adopted by the Venice Commission at its 86th plenary session (Venice, 25-26 March 2011). Available at: [https://www.venice.coe.int/webforms/documents/?pdf=CDL-AD\(2011\)003rev-e](https://www.venice.coe.int/webforms/documents/?pdf=CDL-AD(2011)003rev-e). (Accessed on 10 Aug. 2021).
40. Visyn, V., Zemko, A., Hlamazda, P., Pundor, I., Kamardina, Y., & Fridmanska, V. (2021). Conceptual principles of law in the context of the development of the theory of the state and law. *AD ALTA: Journal of interdisciplinary research*, 11(2), Special Issue XX, 25-29.
41. Yakoviyk, I., Chyzhov, D., Karpachova, N., Hlushchenko, S., & Chaliuk, Yu. (2020). National security policy in Ukraine: a change in the system of power relations of the modern world. *Revista San Gregorio*, 42, 224-235.
42. Yanyshyn, Ya., Sodoma, R., Markiv, G., Lypych, L., Shmatkovska, T., & Shidnytka, G. (2020). Economic efficiency of the nuts complex business in the agriculture of Ukraine. *Scientific Papers Series "Management, Economic Engineering in Agriculture and Rural Development"*, 20(2), 531-536.
43. Zhurakovska, I.V., Sydorenko, R.V., Shmatkovska, T.O., & Brodska, I.I. (2020). Factors of influence on employment in small and medium-sized business in Ukraine. *Financial and credit activity: problems of theory and practice*, 32(1), 109-119.

Primary Paper Section: A

Secondary Paper Section: AG